

**PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
MINUTES OF COMMISSION MEETING
OF NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

The meeting convened at 2:32 PM, Monday, November 25, 2019 in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania.

ATTENDANCE:

Commissioners:

Joel Bolstein, Chair
Dr. Raquel O. Yiengst, Vice Chair
Mayur Patel, Secretary (absent)
Rad Agrawal (phone)
George Dawson (phone)
Michael Hardiman
Curtis Jones (absent)
Gerald S. Robinson
Adrian Shanker
Aleena Sorathia

Staff:

Chad Dion Lassiter, Executive Director
Leslie Morant, Chief Counsel
Jinada Rochelle, Director of Enforcement
Carl Summerson, Hearing Examiner
Guerline L. Laurore, Esq., Director of Policy and Intergovernmental Affairs
Lyle Wood, Pittsburgh Regional Office Director
Heather Roth, Harrisburg Regional Office Director
Diana Medley, Philadelphia Regional Office Director
Debbie Walters, Administrative Officer
Anja Velemir, Special Assistant to Executive Director
Tameka Hatcher, Education & Outreach Coordinator

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Bolstein called the meeting to order. The meeting had been advertised and was open to the public, in accordance with the provisions of the Sunshine Act. Prior to the meeting, in keeping with the confidentiality requirements of the Sunshine Act; there had been a closed session to discuss compliance matters.

Attendance was taken and a quorum noted.

ADJUDICATION

Prior to the commission's vote on the disposition of a complaint for which a public hearing has been held. the Pennsylvania Human Relations Act requires the commission to review the recommended findings, conclusions and order made by the permanent hearing examiner or hearing panel and to approve or reverse the findings, conclusions and order before service of such order on the parties to the complaint. Each commissioner voting today signified by his or her vote that he or she has reviewed the entire record in these matters to determine whether the recommended findings are supported by substantial evidence. Furthermore,

because it is for the commission, as the adjudicative body to determine whether the respondent has engaged in or is engaging in an unlawful discriminatory practice as defined by the Pennsylvania Human Relations Act, any findings, conclusions and order approved today are so approved only after the commission itself has determined that the evidence upon which it is based has been resolved correctly; and that any credibility determinations have been decided correctly.

MOTION:

Commissioner Yiengst made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Robinson to approve the recommendation of the Hearing Examiner.

Commissioner Shanker read aloud a section of the opinion for those in attendance. Commissioner Hardiman stated he would be filing a Concurrence in part and Dissent in Part regarding the final order.

Commissioners Robinson, Sorathia, Yiengst and Bolstein voted in agreement, Commissioner Dawson recused himself and Commissioner Hardiman dissented. With a majority of commissioners in agreement, the Final Order is approved and issued.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approval of the Minutes of the July 22, 2019 Public Meeting.

MOTION:

Commissioner Yiengst made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Robinson to approve the minutes of the July 22, 2019 Public Meeting. With all in favor, motion carried.

Approval of the Minutes of the August 26, 2019 Public Meeting

MOTION:

Commissioner Robinson made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Yiengst to approve the minutes of the August 26, 2019 Public Meeting. With all in favor, motion carried.

Approval of the Minutes of the October 27, 2019 Public Meeting

MOTION:

Commissioner Yiengst made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Sorathia to approve the minutes of the October 27, 2019 Public Meeting. Commissioners Robinson and Agrawal abstained. With the remaining in favor, motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Patch, a guest in attendance of the meeting, provided history of the meaning of the term "Redskin" and how this came about from the scalps of Native Americans being used as a form of currency.

Ms. Donna Boyle, the original complainant, spoke to explain the reasons why she felt she had to withdraw her complaint for the safety of her and her son due to threats and harassment from the community.

Chairman Bolstein explained the details of the Neshaminy Final Order and the requirements contained within.

Ms. Boyle commented on the group NAGA who testified as an expert witness for the Respondent in the case. Ms. Boyle went on to share that this group is not recognized by Native Americans as an association that represents them and requested PHRC not allow them to provide the educational component in the Final Order.

NEXT SESSION


The December Commission Meeting will be held Monday, December 16, 2019, at 1:30 PM in Harrisburg, PA.

ADJOURNMENT

Respectfully submitted,



Joel Bolstein
Chairman


o/b/o Mayur Patel

Mayur Patel
Secretary