

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
DEPARTMENT OF STATE
BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS

F I N A L M I N U T E S

MEETING OF:

**STATE BOARD OF VEHICLE MANUFACTURERS,
DEALERS, AND SALESPERSONS**

TIME: 10:30 A.M.

Held at

PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE

2525 North 7th Street

CoPA HUB, Eaton Conference Room

Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110

as well as

VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS

March 10, 2026

1 State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers,
2 Dealers, and Salespersons
3 March 10, 2026
4
5

6 BOARD MEMBERS:
7

8 Irving Stein, Chairman
9 William Heeney, Secretary - Absent
10 Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of
11 Professional and Occupational Affairs
12 Mark W. Wolfe, Deputy Attorney General
13 Angel Layton, Department of Transportation
14 Mark Baer, Professional Member
15 William Egan, Professional Member
16 Jeffrey Foster, Professional Member
17 Steve T. Fretz, Professional Member
18 William Metzinger, Professional Member - Absent
19 Richard Perez, Professional Member
20 Dale J. Yingst, Professional Member - Absent
21
22

23 BUREAU PERSONNEL:
24

25 Laura J. Neal, Esquire, Board Counsel
26 James Kushlan, Board Administrator
27 Timothy Henderson, Esquire, Board Prosecution Liaison
28 Mark Zogby, Esquire, Board Prosecutor
29 Marc Farrell, Esquire, Regulatory Counsel, Office of
30 Chief Counsel
31 Linda Purcell, Division Chief, Real Estate and
32 Licensing Division
33 Deena Parmelee, Legal Office Administrator
34 Willow Marsh, Legislative Aide, Office of Legislative
35 Affairs
36
37

38 ALSO PRESENT:
39

40 Brian Murren, Esquire, Pennsylvania Automotive
41 Association
42 Allison Walker, Sargent's Court Reporting Service,
43 Inc.
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51

1 ***

2 State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers,
3 Dealers, and Salespersons

4 March 10, 2026

5 ***

6 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State
7 Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers, and
8 Salespersons was held on Tuesday, March 10, 2026.
9 Irving Stein, Chairman called the meeting to order at
10 10:30 a.m.

11 ***

12 Roll Call/Introduction of Attendees

13 [James Kushlan, Board Administrator, provided a roll
14 call of Board members and introduction of attendees.
15 A quorum of Board members was present.]

16 ***

17 Public Comments - None

18 ***

19 [Laura J. Neal, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted
20 pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act,
21 the Board entered into Executive Session at 9:00 a.m.
22 to conduct quasi-judicial deliberations and to
23 receive advice of counsel on certain matters listed
24 on the agenda.

25 She stated the Board meeting was being recorded

1 for purposes of completing the required minutes.
2 Voluntary participation in the meeting constituted
3 consent to be recorded.]

4 ***

5 Approval of Minutes of the February 6, 2026 meeting

6 CHAIR STEIN:

7 Do I have a motion to approve the
8 minutes of the last Board Meeting?

9 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

10 Claggett, so moved.

11 MR. EGAN:

12 Egan, second.

13

14 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
15 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Foster, aye;
16 Fretz, aye; Perez, aye; Stein, abstain.

17 [The motion carried. Chair Stein abstained from
18 voting on the matter.]

19 ***

20 Appointment - Annual Prosecution Report

21 [Shana M. Walter, Esquire, Deputy Chief Counsel,
22 Prosecution Division, explained the Bureau of
23 Professional and Occupational Affairs (BPOA) provides
24 administrative and legal support to the 29
25 professional and occupational licensing boards and

1 commissions within the department. The Office of
2 Chief Counsel Prosecution Division works with its
3 investigative (BEI) and compliance arms (PCO) who
4 receive complaints, investigate allegations, and
5 enforce compliance with the acts and regulations that
6 govern the boards and commissions. She stated the
7 Prosecution Division consists of about 40 attorneys,
8 including five senior prosecuting attorneys.

9 Ms. Walter stated the prosecution process always
10 begins with a complaint either from the public or by
11 Board referral. She reported in both 2024 and 2025
12 the department received approximately 22,800 total
13 complaints for all boards. Ms. Walter provided an
14 overview of the investigative process in which the
15 complaint moves through several levels of review. She
16 noted the primary role of prosecution at Board
17 meetings is to present Consent Agreements to the
18 Board.

19 Ms. Walter explained, after the investigative
20 process, the evidence is reviewed by the prosecuting
21 attorney to determine if they believe there have been
22 any violations of the act or regulations, how
23 sufficient the evidence is and determine if
24 additional files need to be opened. She stated, if a
25 violation is suspected the available options include

1 immediate temporary suspension, filing an order to
2 show cause, automatic suspension, an order for a
3 mental or physical examination, and a petition for
4 appropriate relief if the case violates a previous
5 Board order. Avenues for discipline types are
6 revocation, suspension, probation, public reprimand,
7 civil penalty, remedial education, and cost of
8 investigation. She added all investigations are
9 confidential and are not subject to right-to-know
10 requests.

11 Ms. Walters shared, in 2025, there were 17,354
12 cases opened and 19,131 cases closed, up
13 significantly from 2024. Specifically for this
14 Board, she reported 990 cases were opened with 966
15 cases closed. The penalties included 55 monetary,
16 103 license restriction or voluntary surrender, and
17 175 warning letters. 34 individuals were either
18 granted a license or had their license reinstated.
19 At the time of the report being generated, the Board
20 had 36,648 licensees with 957 open cases.]

21 ***

22 Report of Prosecutorial Division

23 [Timothy Henderson, Esquire, Board Prosecution

24 Liaison, noted Agenda Item No. 3 would be tabled. He
25 presented the Consent Agreements for Agenda Item No.

1 4, Case No. 25-60-010043.]

2 ***

3 MS. NEAL:

4 Mr. Chair, at this time, I believe the
5 Board would entertain a motion to
6 approve the Consent Agreement at Item
7 No. 4, and that is Case No. 25-60-
8 010043.

9 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

10 Claggett, so moved.

11 MR. EGAN:

12 Egan, second.

13
14 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
15 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Foster, not
16 audible; Fretz, aye; Perez, aye; Stein,
17 aye.

18 [The motion carried. Mr. Foster had microphone
19 issues and was unable to vote. The Respondent for
20 Agenda Item No. 4, Case No. 25-60-010043, is El
21 Fuerte Auto Sales & Services, LLC.]

22 ***

23 Report of Board Prosecution - Final Adjudication and
24 Orders

25 MS. NEAL:

1 We have four Final Adjudications and
2 Orders.

3 At this time, Mr. Chair, I believe
4 the Board would entertain a motion to
5 adopt as Final the Proposed
6 Adjudications for Item Nos. 5, 6, 7,
7 and 8. Ashley Fisher, Case No. 23-60-
8 017202; Donald E. Kriss, Case No. 24-
9 60-018084; Melvin D. Maneval, Case No.
10 24-60-008177; and Kimberly Morgan, Case
11 No. 21-60-013067.

12 CHAIR STEIN:

13 Do I hear a motion?

14 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

15 Claggett, so moved.

16 MR. EGAN:

17 Egan, second.

18
19 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
20 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Foster, not
21 audible; Fretz, aye; Perez, aye; Stein,
22 aye.

23 [The motion carried. Mr. Foster had microphone
24 issues and was unable to vote.]

25 ***

1 Report of Board Prosecution - Motions to Deem Facts
2 Admitted

3 MS. NEAL:

4 We have one Motion to Deem Facts
5 Admitted. That's at Item No. 9,
6 Mustafa Ekermen T/A Autolot and Carmen
7 Auto Group, Case Nos. 23-60-001686, 23-
8 60-003115, 23-60-005370, 23-60-008602,
9 and 25-60-014685.

10 At this time, Mr. Chair, I believe
11 the Board would entertain a motion to
12 grant the motion to Deem Facts Admitted
13 and direct Board Counsel to draft a
14 Final Adjudication and Order consistent
15 with Executive Session deliberations.

16 CHAIR STEIN:

17 Do I hear a motion?

18 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

19 Claggett, so moved.

20 MR. EGAN:

21 Egan, second.

22
23 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
24 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Foster, not
25 audible; Fretz, aye; Perez, aye; Stein,

1 aye.

2 [The motion carried. Mr. Foster had microphone
3 issues and was unable to vote.]

4 ***

5 Report of Board Prosecution - Miscellaneous

6 MS. NEAL:

7 The next matter is a Petition for
8 Reconsideration at Item No. 10, Trailer
9 Sales of Lancaster, LLC, Case No. 25-
10 60-019367.

11 At this time, Mr. Chair, I believe
12 the Board would entertain a motion to
13 grant the Petition for Reconsideration
14 and vacate the provisional denial.

15 CHAIR STEIN:

16 Motion?

17 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

18 Claggett, so moved.

19 MR. EGAN:

20 Egan, second.

21

22 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
23 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Foster, not
24 audible; Fretz, aye; Perez, aye; Stein,
25 aye.

1 [The motion carried. Mr. Foster had microphone
2 issues and was unable to vote.]

3 ***

4 [Laura J. Neal, Esquire, Board Counsel, presented the
5 biannual Sunshine Act and Recusal Guidelines
6 Presentation. She summarized that the Sunshine Act
7 ensures transparency in government by requiring open
8 meetings for all official actions and deliberations
9 involving agency matters. Any time a quorum of Board
10 members meets to discuss Board business, the meeting
11 must be publicly advertised. Deliberations are
12 defined as discussions intended to lead to decisions,
13 and official actions include votes or policy
14 decisions.

15 Public notice of meetings must be issued at the
16 beginning of the calendar year and at least three
17 days in advance, with any changes requiring 24-hour
18 notice. Emergency meetings are exempt but must be
19 justified. All meetings and agendas are posted
20 publicly, including in the Pennsylvania Bulletin and
21 on the Board's website.

22 Ms. Neal noted amendments to the Sunshine Act in
23 2021 require, if the agenda changes within 24 hours
24 of the meeting, an amended agenda must be published
25 afterward. Meeting locations and agendas must be

1 made available in advance, and discussions outside
2 the posted agenda are only allowed if there is a
3 natural connection. All votes must be publicly cast,
4 so virtual participant members must have cameras on.
5 Meeting minutes must include the time, place,
6 attendance, and substance of discussions, though not
7 verbatim. Executive sessions may be held for limited
8 purposes, such as discussing litigation strategy,
9 deliberation matters, or personnel issues, though
10 personnel issues typically fall outside Board
11 purview. Executive sessions must be announced with
12 reasons and remain confidential even after the
13 meeting.

14 She warned that violations of the Sunshine Act
15 can invalidate meeting actions and lead to litigation
16 or attorney fees. Criminal penalties are rare and
17 require District Attorney action. She clarified that
18 actions of Board committees like the Application
19 Committee or Probable Cause Committee are not
20 considered to be a meeting if there is no quorum and
21 if actions are preliminary or administrative.

22 Regarding recusals, Ms. Neal outlined the types
23 of recusals and the impact of those recusals.
24 Mandatory recusals include involvement in
25 prosecution, being a complainant, or having a direct

1 financial interest. Strongly recommended recusals
2 include personal connections or outside knowledge of
3 a case. Discretionary recusals apply when
4 impartiality is uncertain. She advised Board members
5 to consult Counsel in advance when unsure.
6 Abstentions from voting are allowed for lack of
7 preparation or uncertainty but prevent a member from
8 requesting reconsideration later. Members may still
9 attend for quorum purposes, but recusals count
10 against quorum.

11 She also detailed conflict-of-interest rules.
12 Professional members may not serve as officers or
13 agents of statewide professional associations, and
14 public members may not be part of the regulated
15 profession or have immediate family members who are.
16 Public members must not hold any other appointed
17 office in the Commonwealth.]

18 ***

19 Application Review

20 MS. NEAL:

21 The first is a Facility Application at
22 Item No. 12, AA0006833983, GM Used Auto
23 LLC.

24 Mr. Chair, at this time, I believe
25 the Board would entertain a motion to

1 provisionally deny the Application at
2 Item No. 12, GM Used Auto LLC.

3 CHAIR STEIN:

4 Do I hear a motion?

5 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

6 Claggett, so moved.

7 MR. EGAN:

8 Egan, second.

9

10 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
11 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Foster, not
12 audible; Fretz, aye; Perez, aye; Stein,
13 aye.

14 [The motion carried. Mr. Foster had microphone
15 issues and was unable to vote.]

16 ***

17 MS. NEAL:

18 The next Application is at Item No. 13,
19 AA0006439150, Estelle Garcia.

20 At this time, Mr. Chair, I believe
21 the Board would entertain a motion to
22 grant the Application at Item No. 13.

23 CHAIR STEIN:

24 Do I hear a motion?

25 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

1 Claggett, so moved.

2 MR. EGAN:

3 Egan, second.

4

5 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
6 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Foster, not
7 audible; Fretz, aye; Perez, aye; Stein,
8 aye.

9 [The motion carried. Mr. Foster had microphone
10 issues and was unable to vote.]

11 ***

12 MS. NEAL:

13 The next Application is Emmelia Rose
14 Gourley, AA0006719579, Item No. 14.

15 Mr. Chair, I believe the Board
16 would entertain a motion to grant the
17 Application for Licensure, subject to
18 one year of probation.

19 CHAIR STEIN:

20 Motion please.

21 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

22 Claggett, so moved.

23 MR. EGAN:

24 Egan, second.

25

1 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
2 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Fretz, aye;
3 Perez, aye; Stein, aye.

4 [The motion carried unanimously.]

5 ***

6 MS. NEAL:

7 The last Application is Item No. 15,
8 AA0006851023, Jamie T. Rillstone.

9 At this time, Mr. Chair, I believe
10 the Board would entertain a motion to
11 provisionally deny the Application.

12 CHAIR STEIN:

13 Do I hear a motion?

14 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:

15 Claggett, so moved.

16 MR. EGAN:

17 Egan, second.

18
19 Claggett, aye; Wolfe, aye; Layton, aye;
20 Baer, aye; Egan, aye; Fretz, aye;
21 Perez, aye; Stein, aye.

22 [The motion carried unanimously.]

23 ***

24 Report of Board Chairman - No Report

25 ***

1 Report of Acting Commissioner - No Report

2 ***

3 Report of Board Administrator - No Report

4 ***

5 New Business - None.

6 ***

7 Adjournment

8 CHAIR STEIN:

9 We have the schedule of Board Meetings
10 going forward. Other than that, is
11 there any other business? Hearing
12 none, the meeting stands adjourned.

13 ***

14 [There being no further business, the Pennsylvania
15 State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers and
16 Salespersons adjourned at 11:08 a.m.]

17 ***

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers and Salespersons meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of Vehicle Manufacturers, Dealers and Salespersons meeting.



Allison Walker,

Minute Clerk

Sargent's Court Reporting
Service, Inc.

STATE BOARD OF VEHICLE MANUFACTURERS,
DEALERS, AND SALESPERSONS
REFERENCE INDEX

March 10, 2025

	TIME	AGENDA
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10	9:00	Executive Session
11	10:30	Return to Open Session
12		
13	10:30	Open Session/Call to Order
14		
15	10:31	Roll Call/Introduction of Attendees
16		
17	10:32	Approval of Minutes
18		
19	10:33	Appointment - Annual Prosecution Report
20		
21	10:39	Report of Prosecutorial Division
22		
23	10:42	Report of Board Counsel
24		
25	11:04	Application Review
26		
27	11:08	Adjournment
28		
29		
30		
31		
32		
33		
34		
35		
36		
37		
38		
39		
40		
41		
42		
43		
44		
45		
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		