State Real Estate Commission April 2, 2025

3 4 5

1 2

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

6 7

9

Absent

10 11

12 13 Absent

14 15 16

17 18

19

20

21 22

23 24 25

38 39 40

41

42

43 44 45

46 47 48

49 50 Kyle Sampson, Chair, Public Member

Annie Hanna Cestra, Vice Chair, Industry Member -

Guy Saxton, Secretary, Cemetery Member Jeffrey J. Johnson, Industry Member - Absent Anne M. Rubin, Industry Member

Armand N. Ferrara Jr., Industry Member Gaetano P. Piccirilli, Esquire, Public Member -

Jennifer Thomson, Esquire, Attorney General Designee Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs

COMMISSION PERSONNEL:

Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel Angela L. Solomon, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Ashley P. Murphy, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Commission Prosecution Liaison

Deon Bowers, Commission Administrator Elle Thompson, Law Clerk, PA Department of State Tyesha C. Miley, Esquire, Office of General Counsel, PA Department of State

Jessica Zukoski, Senior Legal Analyst, PA Department of State

Richard Morrissette, Deputy Director, Bureau of Enforcement and Investigation, PA Department of State

Willow Marsh, Legislative Aide, PA Department of State

ALSO PRESENT:

Francesca Tracy, Compliance Analyst, CE Shop Tracy Matroni, Education & Member Services, Lancaster County Association of Realtors Katelyn Taylor Czarnik, Senior Litigation Counsel,

Everstory Partners

Annette C. Collier, President, Greater Philadelphia Association of Realtors

State Real Estate Commission April 2, 2025

ALSO

ALSO PRESENT: (cont.)

James Olivieri, Real Estate Broker, Penn-Jersey Realty, LLC

Lisa Aaron, Professional Standards/Education Manager, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors

Hank Lerner, Esquire, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors

Marcus Huertas, Advocacy Manager, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors

Lisa Ginsburg, Esquire, Bucks County Association of Realtors

Anne Marie Allen, Member Services and Operations Manager, Bucks County Association of Realtors Jacob Hill, Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.

1

2 State Real Estate Commission

April 2, 2025

* * *

3

4

18

19

20

21

22

[Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 9:00 a.m. the Commission entered into Executive Session with Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations on a number of matters currently pending before the Commission and to receive advice of counsel. The Commission returned to open session at 10:24 a.m.]

13 ***

[Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel, informed everyone that the meeting was being recorded, and voluntary participation constituted consent to be recorded.

Mr. Picarella also noted the Commission entered into Executive Session for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations on a number of matters currently pending before the Commission and to receive the advice of counsel.]

23

24 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State Real 25 Estate Commission was held on Wednesday, April 2,

1 2025. Kyle Sampson, Chair, Public Member, officially 2 called the meeting to order at 10:24 a.m. 3 Roll Call/Introduction of Attendees 4 5 [Deon Bowers, Commission Administrator, provided a roll call of Commission members and introduction of 6 7 attendees. A quorum of Commission members was present.] 9 10 Pledge of Allegiance [The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.] 11 * * * 12 13 Approval of Minutes of the February 11, 2025 meeting 14 CHAIR SAMPSON: 15 Is there a motion to approve the 16 Minutes from February 11, 2025? 17 COMMISSIONER FERRARA: 18 So moved. CHAIR SAMPSON: 19 20 Is there a second? 21 MS. RUBIN: 22 I have a correction to the Minutes. 23 CHAIR SAMPSON: 24 State your correction. 25 MS. RUBIN:

On page 22 where there is the discussion that we had about the dates for the travel meeting, I'd like to correct two things. One is that the conflict was not based on personal commitments. It was based on a major religious holiday and a statement that a meeting should not be held outside of our normal meetings when we travel on anyone's major religious holiday. And I'd like the Minutes to reflect that it was not about personal commitments.

And the other thing in the Minutes that I would like corrected is that it stated that the Commission decided the issue would be tabled. There was never a vote taken by the Commission. It was the Chair that decided that the issue should be tabled.

20 MR. PICARELLA:

I guess it is open for discussion as to whether those are acceptable changes to the Minutes.

24 CHAIR SAMPSON:

I don't see it the way that

Commissioner Rubin sees it, so I would 1 2 oppose it. 3 Should we take a vote? What's the 4 procedure for that? 5 MR. PICARELLA: 6 You have to take a vote on whether you 7 accept the changes or if you accept it as written. So I guess we should do a 9 vote as to whether the Chair would 10 accept a motion to adopt the Minutes of the February 11, 2025 meeting as 11 presented. And we'll take it from 12 13 there. 14 CHAIR SAMPSON: 15 And Commissioner Claggett was absent. 16 So you abstain? ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT: 17 18 Yes. 19 CHAIR SAMPSON: 20 Is there a motion? 21 MR. FERRARA: 22 So moved. 23 CHAIR SAMPSON: 24 Is there a second? 25 MS. RUBIN:

1 Second.

2 CHAIR SAMPSON:

Board Administrator, please call the

roll.

5 MS. BOWERS:

4

9

6 Kyle Sampson, yes; Guy Saxton, yes;

7 Anne Rubin, no; Armand Ferrara, yes;

Jennifer Thomson, yes; Arion Claggett,

abstain.

10 [The motion carried. Anne Rubin voted against the

11 | motion and Acting Commissioner Claggett abstained

12 from voting on the motion.]

13 ***

14 Report of Prosecutorial Division

15 [Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Commission Prosecution

16 Liaison, on behalf of Ashley Murphy, Esquire,

17 presented the Consent Agreements for Case No. 22-56-

18 012781 and Case No. 22-56-018432.

19 Mr. Fritsch then presented the Consent Agreement

20 for Case Nos. 23-56-005187 & 24-56-006103.

21 Angela L. Solomon, Esquire, Commission

22 | Prosecutor, presented the Consent Agreements for Case

23 No. 22-56-011668 and Case No. 24-56-010103. Ms.

24 | Solomon withdrew Item No. 6, the Consent Agreement

25 for Case Nos. 21-56-010852 & 23-56-011347, for

9 consideration at a later date. 1 2 Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission 3 Prosecutor, presented the Consent Agreement for Case No. 21-56-018617.] 4 5 MR. PICARELLA: 6 Based upon discussions in Executive 7 Session, I believe the Commission Chair would accept a motion to approve the 9 Consent Agreements presented by the Prosecution at Item No. 2 on the 10 Agenda, Case No. 22-56-012781; Item No. 11 12 3 on the Agenda, Case No. 22-56-018432; 13 Item No. 5 on the Agenda, Case No. 24-14 56-010103; Item No. 7 on the Agenda, 15 Case No. 21-56-018617; and Item No. 8 16 on the Agenda, Case No. 23-56-005187 and Case No. 24-56-006103. 17 18 CHAIR SAMPSON: Is there a motion? 19 20 MR. FERRARA: 21 So moved. 22 CHAIR SAMPSON: 23 Is there a second?

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

Second.

24

25

MS. RUBIN:

10 CHAIR SAMPSON: 1 2 Board Administrator, please call the 3 roll. MS. BOWERS: 4 5 Kyle Sampson, aye; Guy Saxton, aye; 6 Anne Rubin, aye; Armand Ferrara, aye; 7 Jennifer Thomson, aye; Arion Claggett, 8 aye. 9 [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's 10 name at Item No. 2, Case No. 22-56-012781, is Rachel 11 M. Novalesi. 12 The Respondent's name at Item No. 3, Case No. 22-13 56-018432 is Aida Sanchez. The Respondent's name at Item No. 5, Case No. 24-14 15 56-010103 is Edwin D. Pope. 16 The Respondent's name at Item No. 7, Case No. 21-56-018617, is Fahad Khan. 17 18 The Respondents' names at Item No. 8, Case Nos. 19 23-56-005187 & 24-56-006103, are Raymond M. Abboud 20 and 500, Inc.] 21 * * * 22 Report of Commission Counsel 23 MR. PICARELLA: 24 Moving to Item No. 4 on the Agenda. 25 Based upon discussions in Executive

```
11
                  Session, I believe our Commission Chair
1
2
                  would entertain a motion to reject the
3
                  Consent Agreement in that matter as
 4
                  being too lenient.
5
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
6
                  Is there a motion?
7
   MR. FERRARA:
8
                  So moved.
9
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
10
                  Is there a second?
11
   MS. RUBIN:
                  Second.
12
13
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
14
                  Board Administrator, please call the
15
                  roll.
   MS. BOWERS:
16
17
                  Kyle Sampson, aye; Guy Saxton, aye;
18
                  Anne Rubin, aye; Armand Ferrara, aye;
19
                  Jennifer Thomson, aye; Arion Claggett,
20
                  aye.
21
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
22
23
   Report of Commission Counsel - Proposed Adjudication
24
   and Order
25
   MR. PICARELLA:
```

The first is Item No. 9, Markea A.

Golphin. That is Case No. 24-56-

011464.

3

10

Based upon discussions in Executive

Session, I believe the Commission Chair

would entertain a motion to adopt the

hearing examiner's proposed

Adjudication and Order and direct

Counsel to prepare the Commission's

Counsel to prepare the commission

final order.

11 CHAIR SAMPSON:

12 Is there a motion?

13 MR. FERRARA:

So moved.

15 CHAIR SAMPSON:

16 Is there a second?

17 MS. RUBIN:

18 Second.

19 CHAIR SAMPSON:

20 Madam Administrator, please call the

21 roll.

22 MS. BOWERS:

23 Kyle Sampson, aye; Guy Saxton, aye;

Anne Rubin, aye; Armand Ferrara, aye;

Jennifer Thomson, aye; Arion Claggett,

13 1 aye. 2 [The motion carried unanimously.] 3 4 MR. PICARELLA: 5 With the Chair's approval, I will jump down to Items No. 11 and 12 on the 6 7 Agenda since there is a recusal on Item No. 10. 8 9 CHAIR SAMPSON: 10 Please. 11 MR. PICARELLA: 12 Okay. At Item No. 11 on the Agenda and 13 item No. 12, I'm going to do them all 14 together since they stem from one 15 proposed Adjudication and Order. All 16 five of these matters are one proposed A&O. 17 18 So, based upon discussions in Executive Session, I believe the Chair 19 20 would entertain a motion at Items No. 11 on the Agenda, Lisa McAteer, 21 22 Alexander T. McAteer, and Carl John 23 Will at Case Nos. 23-56-011481, 23-56-24 011482, and 23-56-011483; and at Item

No. 12 on the Agenda, Scranton Wilkes

```
1
                  Barre Regional Realty LLC and Sherrie
2
                  L. Miller, Case Nos. 23-56-017442 and
3
                  23-56-017443. The motion would be to
                  direct Counsel to draft a final
 4
 5
                  Adjudication and Order in this matter
                  consistent with the discussions in
 6
7
                  Executive Session.
8
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
9
                  Is there a motion?
10
   MR. FERRARA:
11
                  So moved.
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
12
13
                  Is there a second?
14
   MS. RUBIN:
15
                  Second.
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
16
17
                  Madam Administrator, please call the
18
                  roll.
   MS. BOWERS:
19
20
                  Kyle Sampson, aye; Guy Saxton, aye;
21
                  Anne Rubin, aye; Armand Ferrara, aye;
22
                  Jennifer Thomson, aye; Arion Claggett,
23
                  aye.
24
    [The motion carried unanimously.]
25
```

| | | 15 |
|----|-----|--|
| 1 | MR. | PICARELLA: |
| 2 | | Okay. We'll move back up to Item No. 10 |
| 3 | | on the Agenda. And I believe one of our |
| 4 | | Commissioners, Anne Rubin, wishes to |
| 5 | | recuse herself from this matter. |
| 6 | | Is that correct? |
| 7 | MS. | RUBIN: |
| 8 | | That is correct. |
| 9 | | So what would you like me to do? Do you |
| 10 | | want me to leave the meeting and come |
| 11 | | back in? |
| 12 | MR. | PICARELLA: |
| 13 | | If you would mute your speaker so you do |
| 14 | | not hear the discussions. When we are |
| 15 | | done with the vote, we will do a thumbs |
| 16 | | up or a hand wave to get you back in. |
| 17 | MS. | RUBIN: |
| 18 | | Very good. Thank you. |
| 19 | MR. | PICARELLA: |
| 20 | | Okay. I believe Commissioner Rubin is |
| 21 | | no longer getting the audio of this |
| 22 | | meeting. |
| 23 | | At Item No. 10 on the Agenda, |
| 24 | | Michael Brian Keifer and April |
| 25 | | Christine Keifer at Case Nos. 23-56- |

012681 and 23-56-012682, and <u>Frank J.</u>

2 Rinaldi at Case No. 24-56-008852.

I believe that the Commission Chair

4 would entertain a motion to direct

5 Counsel to draft a final Adjudication

and Order in this matter consistent

7 with the discussions in Executive

8 Session.

9 CHAIR SAMPSON:

10 Is there a motion?

11 MR. FERRARA:

12 So moved.

13 CHAIR SAMPSON:

Is there a second?

15 MR. SAXTON:

16 Second.

17 CHAIR SAMPSON:

18 Madam Administrator, please call the

19 roll.

20 MS. BOWERS:

21 Kyle Sampson, aye; Guy Saxton, aye;

22 Armand Ferrara, aye; Jennifer Thomson,

aye; Arion Claggett, aye.

24 | [The motion carried. Anne Rubin recused herself from

25 | voting on the matter.]

1

2 | [Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel,

3 | noted that Item No. 9, Case No. 24-56-011464, was an

4 application case, and the result of that approval was

5 | that Ms. Golphin would have her application for

6 | licensure granted.]

7

8 | Final Adjudications and Order - None

9 ***

10 Regulatory Report

11 [Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel,

12 noted that Marc Farrell, Esquire, Regulatory Counsel,

13 | could not attend the meeting but had provided Mr.

14 Picarella with updates through email.

Mr. Farrell continues to actively work on the

16 | rulemaking package for general revisions, Regulation

17 | No. 16A-5616. Mr. Farrell also continues working on

18 the final rulemaking package for broker price

19 opinions at Regulation No. 16A-5626 and on the final

20 rulemaking for Act 41 Licensure by Endorsement,

21 | Regulation No. 16A-5625.]

22 **

23 Report of the Commission Chairperson - None

24 ***

25 Report of Acting Commissioner - None

1

2 Report of Commission Administrator

3 | [Deon Bowers, Commission Administrator, reported that

4 | the majority of the 2024 renewal audits had been

5 reviewed, and a full audit should be completed by the

6 end of April 2025.]

7

8 Report of Committees

9 | Education/Examination Committee

10 MR. PICARELLA:

11 There's one matter to be voted on that

12 was before the Education Committee.

13 It's Item No. 13 on the Agenda, the

14 Broker Examination Request of Jonathan

15 Wallace.

16 Based upon discussions in Executive

17 Session, I believe the Commission Chair

18 would entertain a motion to

19 provisionally deny the application of

Jonathan Wallace to sit for the

21 Broker's License Examination.

22 CHAIR SAMPSON:

20

Is there a motion?

24 MR. FERRARA:

25 So moved.

```
19
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
1
2
                  Is there a second?
3
   MR. SAXTON:
 4
                  Second.
5
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
6
                  Madam Administrator, please call the
7
                  roll.
8
   MS. BOWERS:
9
                  Kyle Sampson, no; Guy Saxton, aye; Anne
10
                  Rubin, aye; Armand Ferrara, aye;
11
                  Jennifer Thomson, aye; Arion Claggett,
12
                  aye.
13
   [The motion carried. Kyle Sampson voted against the
14
   motion.]
15
                               * * *
16
   Application Reviews
17
   [Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel,
18
   informed the Commission that No. 14 on the Agenda,
19
   the application review of Vincent Michael Besash,
20
   would be tabled until Mr. Besash could provide
21
   additional information on the matter.]
22
23
   Informal Conferences
   MR. PICARELLA:
24
25
                  Item No. 16 of the Agenda. Based upon
```

```
20
                  discussions in Executive Session, I
1
                  believe the Commission Chair would
2
3
                  entertain a motion to approve the
                  application of Timothy Nicholas Tomasic
 4
5
                  to sit for the salesperson examination.
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
6
7
                  Is there a motion?
8
   MR. FERRARA:
9
                  So moved.
10
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
11
                  Is there a second?
   MS. RUBIN:
12
13
                  Second.
14
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
15
                  Madam Administrator, please call the
16
                  roll.
   MR. PICARELLA:
17
18
                  Before we do, Chair, during the
19
                  conference, did Mr. Tomasic say that he
20
                  has already taken the examination and
21
                  passed?
22
   CHAIR SAMPSON:
23
                  He did.
24
   MR. PICARELLA:
25
                  So I would ask if the Chair would
```

21 1 entertain an adopted motion to grant 2 the Licensure for Examination of a 3 Salesperson application of Timothy Nicholas Tomasic. 4 CHAIR SAMPSON: 5 6 Is there a motion? 7 MR. FERRARA: 8 So moved. 9 CHAIR SAMPSON: 10 Is there a second? MS. RUBIN: 11 Second. 12 13 CHAIR SAMPSON: 14 Madam Administrator, please call the 15 roll. MS. BOWERS: 16 17 Kyle Sampson, aye; Guy Saxton, aye; 18 Anne Rubin, aye; Armand Ferrara, aye; 19 Jennifer Thomson, aye; Arion Claggett, 20 aye. 21 [The motion carried unanimously.] 22 23 Old/New Business - Discussion to Select Dates for 24 Philadelphia and Pittsburgh Meetings 25 [Deon Bowers, Commission Administrator, began a

1 discussion on selecting dates for the Commission's 2 Philadelphia meeting date.

Armand N. Ferrara Jr., Industry Member, brought up that the Commission could also explore the possibility of hosting the meeting in Pittsburgh since they did not meet there in 2024. He believed it would be fair to switch between Philadelphia and Pittsburgh each year, so members from each side of the state could be represented and see the Commission in person.

Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel, stated that he agreed with this sentiment, but that it was unlikely that the Commission could meet in either Pittsburgh or Philadelphia in 2025 due to timing and scheduling. He elected to push those two off-site meetings to 2026.

Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, stated that the Commission is not required to host in-person meetings anymore because of Act 100, which allows for a virtual quorum. He expressed that the Commission still has the ability to have in-person meetings, but his schedule for 2025 would not allow him to attend an off-site in Philadelphia. Acting Commissioner Claggett asked Counsel to instead discuss dates for a 2026 off-site meeting for Pittsburgh or Philadelphia.

2.3

Mr. Picarella asked the Commission to consider whether they would prefer to have one in the spring and one in the fall or if they would prefer them consecutively. Acting Commissioner Claggett stated that they should look for dates when colleges are in session, so college students in real estate programs could attend a Commission meeting and see what they consist of.

Jennifer Thomson, Esquire, Attorney General
Designee, asked the Commission if they would prefer
to have an educational building as the meeting
location. Acting Commissioner Claggett endorsed this
idea but noted that they could also host the meeting
at a state building in Pittsburgh. He mentioned that
personnel from the Bureau of Professional and
Occupational Affairs (BPOA) were being moved to Piatt
Place in Pittsburgh, and offered it as a possible
venue for the Commission's meeting.

Kyle Sampson, Chair, proposed that the matter be tabled until the next meeting after the Commissioners have reviewed their schedules. Mr. Picarella suggested looking at their schedules for February, March, May, September, October, and December 2026.]

* * *

25 Public Session

1 [Annette C. Collier, President, Greater Philadelphia

- 2 Association of Realtors, asked the Commission if they
- 3 knew of any physical or virtual videos providing
- 4 ethics training for realtors. Arion R. Claggett,
- 5 Acting Commissioner, affirmed that they have been
- 6 looking into the matter and would soon provide her
- 7 | with information.
- 8 Ms. Collier also inquired as to any updates
- 9 regarding Temple University's goal of providing
- 10 additional support to returning citizens interested
- 11 | in becoming realtors. Kyle Sampson, Chair, replied
- 12 that the Commission had yet to follow up on that
- 13 topic.
- Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel,
- 15 responded that Ms. Collier should contact Temple
- 16 University regarding the matter since it is their
- 17 | program and not the Commission's.]
- 18
- 19 CHAIR SAMPSON:
- 20 That concludes this meeting of the
- 21 Pennsylvania Real Estate Commission.
- 22 Motion to adjourn?
- 23 MR. FERRARA:
- So moved.
- 25 ***

[There being no further business, the State Real Estate Commission Meeting adjourned at 11:09 a.m.] * * * CERTIFICATE I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Real Estate Commission meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Real Estate Commission meeting. Minute Clerk Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.