1	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
2	DEPARTMENT OF STATE
3	BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS
4	
5	
6	<u>FINAL MINUTES</u>
7	
8	MEETING OF:
9	
10	STATE BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC
11	
12	TIME: 10:30 A.M.
13	
14	Held at
15	PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE
16	2525 North 7th Street
17	CoPA HUB, Eaton Conference Room
18	Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110
19	as well as
20	VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS
21	
22	October 17, 2024
23	
24	
25	

2 1 State Board of Chiropractic 2 October 17, 2024 3 4 5 6 BOARD MEMBERS: 7 William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs 8 9 10 Jonathan W. McCullough Jr., D.C., Secretary 11 Elizabeth Oquendo, Esquire, MBA, Senior Deputy 12 Attorney General, Consumer Protection Member Michael S. Swank, D.C. 13 14 Brian Moreland, D.C. 15 16 17 BUREAU PERSONNEL: 18 19 Dana M. Wucinski, Esquire, Acting Senior Board 20 Counsel 21 Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel 22 Thomas M. Davis, Esquire, Regulatory Board Counsel 23 J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Senior Board Prosecutor 24 and Prosecution Liaison 25 Riley Baker, Esquire, Board Prosecutor 26 Shakeena Chappelle, Board Administrator Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Deputy Policy Director, 27 Department of State 28 29 Carlton Smith, Deputy Chief Counsel, Prosecution 30 Division 31 Michael P. Merten, Esquire, Board Counsel, State 32 Board of Barber Examiners 33 Stephanie Dunkerley, Legal Analyst, Office of General Counsel 34 35 Riley Baker, Law Clerk, Department of State 36 37 38 ALSO PRESENT: 39 40 Andrew Heck, D.C., President, Pennsylvania 41 Chiropractic Association 42 Keith Miller, D.C., Pennsylvania Chiropractic 43 Association 44 Jennifer Smeltz, Republican Executive Director, 45 Senate Consumer Protection & Professional Licensure 46 Committee 47 Chris Young, D.C., Secretary, Pennsylvania 48 Chiropractic Association 49 50

		3
1 2 3 4	State Board of Chiropractic October 17, 2024	J
4 5 6	ALSO PRESENT: (cont.)	
7 8 9 10 11 23 44 56 7 8 9 10 11 23 45 67 89 0 12 34 56 7 8 9 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 33 45 67 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 22 24 56 7 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 45 67 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 23 34 56 7 89 0 12 2 3 45 56 7 89 0 12 2 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3	James Kutz, Esquire, Co-Chair of the Appellate Department/Chair of the Regulatory & Administrative Agency Law and Professional Licensure Practice Groups, Post & Schell, P.C. Mike Barba, Executive Director, Pennsylvania Chiropractic Association Doug Babin, CPCU, AIC, CIFI, FCLS, State Farm Insurance Companies Special Investigative Unit President - Pennsylvania Auto Crime Investigator's Association Jeffrey Wack, D.C., Nazareth Chiropractic Ted Mowatt, CAE, Vice President, Wanner Associates, on behalf of the of the Chiropractor Fellowship of Pennsylvania Diana Rocco, D.C., Vital Link Chiropractic Kristen Bentson, D.C., Lehigh Valley Chiropractic Amanda Rodriguez, Paralegal, Post & Schell, P.C. George E. Khoury, D.C., District III Director, Federation of Chiropractic Licensing Boards Allison Walker, Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.	

4 * * * 1 2 State Board of Chiropractic 3 October 17, 2024 * * * 4 5 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 9:30 a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session 6 7 with Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, for the 8 purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations 9 and to receive the advice of counsel. The Board 10 returned to open session at 10:30 a.m.] * * * 11 Official Call to Order 12 13 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, called the 14 meeting of the State Board of Chiropractic to order 15 at 10:30 a.m.] * * * 16 17 Introduction of Board Members and Attendees 18 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, requested an introduction of Board members and attendees. A 19 20 quorum of Board members was present.] * * * 21 22 [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, informed 23 everyone that the meeting was being recorded, and 24 those who continued to participate were giving their 25 consent to be recorded.

1 Mr. Jayman also noted the Board entered into 2 Executive Session for the purpose of conducting 3 quasi-judicial deliberations on a number of matters 4 currently pending before the Board and to receive the 5 advice of counsel.] * * * 6 7 Approval of minutes of the August 22, 2024 meeting 8 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 9 Approval of the minutes of the August 22, 2024 State Board of Chiropractic 10 11 Meeting. DR. MCCULLOUGH: 12 13 I make a motion that we approve the 14 minutes as transcribed. 15 DR. SWANK: 16 Second. 17 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 18 Roll call vote. 19 20 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Commissioner 21 Claggett, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye; 22 Elizabeth Oquendo, abstain; Dr. Swank, 23 aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. 24 [The motion carried. Elizabeth Oquendo abstained 25 from voting on the motion.]

5

6 * * * 1 2 Report of Prosecution - No Report 3 [J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Senior Prosecutor and 4 Board Prosecution Liaison, had nothing to report from 5 prosecution.] * * * 6 7 Report of Acting Commissioner 8 [Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of 9 Professional and Occupational, informed Board members 10 that a vendor was selected for replacement of the 11 Pennsylvania Licensing System (PALS), and System 12 Automation would be implemented at the end of 2025.] 13 * * * 14 Report of Board Counsel 15 MR. JAYMAN: 16 Based on Executive Session deliberations, I believe the Chair 17 18 would entertain a motion to accept the 19 Final Adjudication and Order as written 20 and deny the request for oral argument 21 in the Matter of Stephen Dwight Herto, 22 Case No. 20-43-010476. 23 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 24 So moved. 25 CHAIR AUKERMAN:

7 1 Do we have a second? 2 DR. SWANK: 3 Second. CHAIR AUKERMAN: 4 5 Roll call vote on the Adjudication and Order at Case No. 20-43-010476. 6 7 8 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Commissioner 9 Claggett, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye; 10 Elizabeth Oquendo, aye; Dr. Swank, aye; 11 Dr. Moreland, aye. 12 [The motion carried unanimously.] 13 * * * 14 Report of Board Counsel - Proposed Adjudication and 15 Order MR. JAYMAN: 16 17 Item 3 on the agenda. Based on 18 Executive Session deliberations, I believe the Chair would entertain a 19 20 motion to direct Board Counsel to draft 21 an Adjudication and Order consistent 22 with discussions in Executive Session 23 in the Matter of Antony Louis Graham, Case No. 21-43-006953. 24 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 25

1 So moved. 2 DR. SWANK: 3 Second. 4 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 5 Roll call vote. 6 7 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Commissioner 8 Claggett, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye; 9 Elizabeth Oquendo, aye; Dr. Swank, aye; 10 Dr. Moreland, aye. 11 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 12 13 Appointment 14 [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted 15 receiving confirmation that Mr. McGrath would not be 16 appearing for the scheduled hearing.] MR. JAYMAN: 17 18 With regard to item 7 on the agenda, based upon discussion in Executive 19 20 Session, it is my understanding that 21 the Board would entertain a motion to 22 table the Matter of Robert McGrath, 23 Case No. 23-43-012580, for him to 24 provide proof pursuant to 49 Pa. Code 25 § 5.17 regarding reactivating his

8

1 license. 2 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 3 So moved. 4 DR. SWANK: 5 Second. 6 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 7 Roll call vote, Shakeena. 8 9 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Commissioner 10 Claggett, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye; 11 Elizabeth Oquendo, aye; Dr. Swank, aye; 12 Dr. Moreland, aye. 13 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 14 15 Report of Board Counsel - Discussion - Chiropractic 16 Continuing Education [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, referred to 17 18 the Chiropractic Practice Act and stated the Board would like to change the 24 hours of online 19 20 continuing education to 12 in person and 12 online. 21 He mentioned the Board voted on that change, but it 22 did not get to the Governor's Office during the 23 pandemic and is why it is not on this licensing 24 cycle. 25 Mr. Davis requested confirmation that the Board

9

currently allows 24 online and wanted to change that 1 2 to a mandatory 12 in person. He noted Act 100 was 3 passed approximately two or three years ago and 4 promotes the use of virtual continuing education, and 5 the Board would be doing the converse of Act 100. Нe 6 explained that it would be difficult to try to start 7 mandating in-person continuing education but could 8 certainly try.

9 Acting Commission Claggett informed Board members10 that he would be against that requirement.

Chair Aukerman believed the profession would be 11 12 better served as a hands-on profession if it had more 13 in-person continuing education classes for licensees. 14 Keith Miller, D.C., former president, 15 Pennsylvania Chiropractic Association, noted being in 16 support but the Independent Regulatory Review 17 Commission (IRRC) shut it down around 2012 because it 18 did not go far enough to protect people. He 19 emphasized that they are a hands-on profession and 20 seeing the degradation of the physical skills of 21 their profession since permitting online education. 22 Dr. Miller mentioned that thousands of senior 23 doctors are bringing on younger doctors who do not

25 hands-on education in a hands-on profession is bad

have the skills. He commented that not getting a

24

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 for the public and profession, along with creating 2 inferior doctors, which will erode the profession 3 over time.

Dr. Miller stated there are many professions where online education makes sense, but a hands-on physical medicine physician-based skillset to not have hands-on education is actually eroding their skills and harming the public trust. He noted that to be his personal belief and what their association feels is best for the profession.

Ms. Oquendo requested clarification that it would be a change from a full 24 hours of online education to 12 in-person hours and 12 online hours.

14 Dr. Miller explained that the problem is that the 15 act currently does not specify it, noting the Board 16 tried to promulgate a regulation around 2010, 2011, 17 and 2012, but IRRC did not feel it went far enough. 18 He explained that the Act was created in the 1970s 19 and updated in 1985 when there was no such thing as 20 online education, so it does not even exist in the 21 Act.

Dr. Miller further explained that because it does not exist and the Board's regulation got shutdown. He stated there is a process right now where the Act would be updated and is a law that will have to be

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 passed, but the Act update could take four to eight 2 years to make its way through the House and the 3 Senate. He reported that Pennsylvania has been rated 4 the second most archaic act in the entire United 5 States by the FCLB.

6 Dr. Miller noted the importance of updating 7 Pennsylvania, because they are losing doctors to 8 other states. He also noted it is becoming very 9 challenging, because their Act is archaic and does 10 not require in-person education like almost every 11 other state does for their profession.

Acting Commissioner Claggett asked Mr. Davis to explain the process if the Board were to change the hours.

15 Mr. Davis informed Board members that he would 16 speak with policy because he did not think it would 17 go through policy in light of Act 100. He mentioned 18 that it was passed in 2021 and referred to a section, 19 where each licensing board and licensing commission 20 shall establish rules and regulations for continuing 21 education that provides for distance education if 22 continuing education is required for license, etc. 23 Mr. Davis explained that the way of the 24 Commonwealth and 99% of licensed professions is to 25 start allowing virtual education in the cases where

1 virtual was not allowed and provided an example. He 2 reported writing regulations in the past year or two 3 explaining how much better virtual education has 4 become post-pandemic. He believed it would be an 5 uphill battle, because it is contrary to what every 6 other board is trying to do at this point.

7 Dr. McCullough stated manipulation is a motor 8 skill and provided an analogy. He commented that 9 chiropractic is unique as a hands-on profession and 10 mentioned that the 24 hours the other way around is 11 just not cutting it. New graduates are not getting 12 it without having some in-person instruction.

Mr. Davis explained that when proposing something that would be unpopular and contrary to Act 100, the Board can still do it with good reasoning. He asked whether Dr. McCullough would be comfortable with him writing a preamble stating the quality of chiropractic care in Pennsylvania is becoming less and less as time goes by.

Andrew Heck, D.C., President, Pennsylvania Chiropractic Association, stated they have been seeing in some chiropractic schools that newer graduates are not fully adjusting patients until trimester 7 out of 10 and noted the importance of the art form of their profession, where they want to

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

craft their skills in a way where they are continuing 1 2 to get better. He stated the online component does 3 not provide the ability to refine their art form. Нe 4 commented that the skills of chiropractors who have 5 been practicing for a long time are not 6 deteriorating, and they just want to build up the 7 skills of the younger professionals entering the 8 state.

9 Dr. Swank mentioned that they also have a new 10 chiropractic college coming into Pennsylvania at the 11 University of Pittsburgh starting next year with the 12 expectation of graduates coming out within three 13 years. He noted the Board will need to look into 14 having some kind of regulation on that new college as 15 well.

Acting Commissioner Claggett asked Mr. Davis to run that issue by policy for further Board discussion at the next meeting.

Mr. Davis offered to reach out to policy and speak with the national association to gather information as far as what other states are doing, because it is something required for the preamble to explain where this would put Pennsylvania in a competitive basis.

25

George Khoury, D.C., District III Director,

Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

Federation of Chiropractic Licensing Boards, offered 1 2 to provide state-by-state comparison from the federal 3 and national boards on those statistics for a side-4 by-side comparison on states' practices that would 5 include continuing education (CE) and some of the 6 other suggestions regarding certified chiropractic 7 clinical assistants (CCCAs) and some of the specialty 8 programs.

9 Dr. Khoury commented that Florida has three 10 chiropractic conventions a year to get CE credits, where all credits had to be by attendance and then 11 went to 50 but can now be all virtual. He mentioned 12 13 that practitioners can choose to get their credits in 14 just X-ray and not manipulation, and some 15 chiropractors do not do manipulation that much, where they are looking at just being able to do CE hours. 16 17 Dr. Khoury noted it also comes into play with 18 licensees who have different licenses in different 19 states, where one of the issues with continuing 20 education in Pennsylvania not approving Providers of 21 Approved Continuing Education (PACE) is that somebody 22 who holds a license in Florida, Delaware, and PA may 23 have to attend each state to get their CE credits. 24 Dr. Khoury noted stated having online CE, makes 25 it easier for people to maintain their CE and

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

maintain licenses in different states. He reported 1 2 that most practitioners throughout the country are 3 not holding multiple state licenses because of the 4 fees and because of the in-person credits. Не 5 mentioned that the trend is more online credits but 6 noted chiropractic is a manual therapy and a 7 manipulative-type treatment for most chiropractors. 8 Dr. Khoury stated it is the job of the schools to 9 teach manipulation and their job to make sure they 10 are able to maintain that skill. He also reported 11 hearing more complaints by patients being injured or 12 hurt by young practitioners doing manipulation 13 because they are not trained and do not have that 14 skillset. 15 Mr. Davis asked Dr. Khoury to send an email 16 though their resource account on the main website at 17 st-chiropractic@pa.gov to get the conversation 18 going.] * * * 19 20 Report of Board Counsel - Discussion - Chiropractic 21 Regulations 22 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, noted prior 23 Board discussion concerning chiropractic regulations 24 involving specialty chiropractic and Board 25 certifications. He stated the Federation of

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

Chiropractic Licensing Boards now has a chiropractor specialty program to vet chiropractic specialty certifications. He noted the importance of making the public aware of who is and is not certified and whether the specialty is false or not. He provided an outline from FCLB.

7 Dr. Khoury explained that the FCLB has created 8 the Recognized Chiropractic Specialties 9 Program (RCSP) for recognized chiropractic specialty 10 programs. He noted it to be a problem in all states 11 where somebody is doing neuropathy, noting 12 chiropractic does not have a specialty in neuropathy. 13 He explained that people are taking weekend courses 14 by somebody who says they are certified, but there is 15 no certifying agency to certify the person who is 16 certified.

Dr. Khoury stated there is not really an approval 17 18 anywhere of specialties that are common other than 19 the American Chiropractic Association and the 20 International Chiropractic Association. He noted 21 there are other neurology programs and concussion 22 programs that are valid and some are not, so the FCLB 23 created a program where they do the vetting of the 24 specialties and are approved as a specialty or not. 25 He explained that state boards could have the trust

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 that the FCLB vetted them and approved them as a 2 specialty and can be called specialists in their 3 state.

Dr. Khoury reported about 17 states have adopted RCSP in their regulations and are looking for Pennsylvania to do the same. He mentioned that it is similar to PACE and is not totally autonomous, where the Board always has the final rule.

9 Dr. Khoury explained that it is only to reduce 10 the burden, overlap in costs, and the differences 11 from a state like Pennsylvania, Ohio, and West 12 Virginia to make sure doctors who have those licenses 13 in those three states can call themselves specialists 14 and and have some type of standardization.

15 Dr. McCullough commented that the Board has been 16 discussing this since 2000 and had a regulatory package. He stated the public is defrauded into 17 18 thinking that a group of initials after the doctor's 19 name actually means something. He noted the American 20 Chiropractic association- and International 21 Chiropractic Association-approved programs, residency 22 programs would be accepted at that time.

Dr. McCullough noted Dr. Khoury to be correct, and anybody who comes before the Board could say they are a specialist or have diplomate status if the

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

Board does not commit to who is and is not a 1 2 specialist if it is not stipulated in the Act. 3 Dr. Khoury addressed the difference between 4 certification and diplomate status, where certification can be 12 hours and does not have a 5 6 competency-based test. He noted the vast difference 7 for the public to see is someone certified in 12 8 hours compared to a 100-hour program through the 9 University of Pittsburgh as a primary spine 10 practitioner (PSP) or a 300-hour program through ACA 11 or ICA as a diplomate.

Dr. Khoury also noted they all have competencybased testing and continuing education attached to them to maintain their diplomate status, which is different than certification.

Dr. Miller stated the scope of practice is being updated. He noted consulting with the FCLB, other states, and experts around the country. He noted that they realized that there was no delineation that makes someone a board-certified X, Y, or Z because the scope was archaic and marginally updated in 1985 to add the adjunct license.

Dr. Miller noted the problem is that immediately recognizing the ICA and the ACA diplomate programs and being aware that quality organizations are out

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 and wanted to include them into the updated scope to
2 protect the public.

3 Dr. Miller stated the FCLB program allows them, 4 as they rewrite the scope and as the Board 5 promulgates regulations, to refer to another body, so 6 when the regulation is either done or the scope is 7 rewritten that they could say based on the recommendation of their organization, which would 8 9 prevent them from having to go back and rewrite a 10 law.

11 Dr. Miller noted they can make it more open-ended 12 by using the FCLB's policies and also makes the 13 Pennsylvania license more ubiquitous to all other 14 states, because they are rated the second most 15 archaic state in the nation by scope. He stated PCA 16 supports this and believes it is would standardize 17 the profession, bring higher standards, and stop some 18 of the people taking silly certifications.

Acting Commissioner Claggett asked Dr. Miller to provide information where Pennsylvania is the second most archaic state by scope.

Dr. Miller explained that Dr. Khoury attended a recent FCLB Convention where they actually used Pennsylvania's scope as the example of what scopes should not look like and could provide more

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 information.

2	Dr. Khoury informed Acting Commissioner Claggett					
3	that it is accumulated information put out by the					
4	Council of Chiropractic Education and is determined					
5	through the United States Department of Education, to					
6	certify chiropractic colleges. He explained that					
7	they look at all of the state scope of practices and					
8	how licensees can come into each state based on that					
9	scope.					
10	Dr. Miller commented that the Department of					
11	Education that licenses and certifies chiropractic					
12	education programs in universities in the nation,					
13	noting Pennsylvania is behind, should have a wake-up					
14	call to what the 2024 standards should be, which is					
15	why the Board needs to rewrite their scope. He also					
16	mentioned that students are going to universities					
17	like Penn State and Pitt and leaving the state to go					
18	elsewhere.					
19	Dr. Miller noted the importance of updates for					
20	certified chiropractic assistants and formalizing					
21	what is or is not a diplomate and a specialist. He					
22	also commented that Act 100 does not direct all					
23	online education but says that boards need to create					
24	rules for online education.]					
25	* * *					

1 Report of Board Counsel - Discussion - Out-of-State 2 Chiropractic Care 3 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, addressed 4 insurance companies now dictating care with 5 technology using out-of-state chiropractors. Нe 6 noted the importance of deciding whether it is legal 7 or not for doctors sitting out of state and not 8 having a PA license examining the patient. He also 9 noted they are so intrusive that a lot of doctors are 10 not taking those patients. 11 Mr. Geschwindt stated prosecution would have to 12 receive a complaint first to start investigating and 13 did not see that conducting a records review for an 14 insurance company to determine what the company would 15 cover would generally be something that they regard 16 as practice that would require a license. 17 Chair Aukerman explained that they do not have 18 the records and are doing this by looking at the 19 number of visits and maybe the age of the patient, 20 where they want the patient released and have 21 different care. He reported receiving a call to get 22 rid of 13 people. He commented that they are into a 23 legal issue and chiropractic malpractice at this 24 point and wanted to make sure he is legally 25 protected.

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

	23			
1	Acting Commissioner Claggett asked Mr. Jayman to			
2	reach out to his chain of command concerning the			
3	issue and provide information at the next meeting.			
4	Dr. McCullough commented that someone who starts			
5	or stops chiropractic is venturing into the practice			
6	of chiropractic medicine, noting the Board has no			
7	ability to adjudicate anything if the person does not			
8	have a Pennsylvania license. He mentioned that he			
9	did not see how they are protecting the public if it			
10	involves a Pennsylvania resident and they cannot			
11	control who does and does not get chiropractic care.			
12	Dr. Miller stated he recently had an insurance			
13	carrier who was cutting off care for no care reason			
14	based on just data metrics, noting the review doctor			
15	he was speaking with was not only not licensed in			
16	Pennsylvania but just graduated and did not have a			
17	license in the state he was living, and they would			
18	hire him based on the fact he graduated because			
19	Pennsylvania does not require licensing at all for			
20	them to do this.			
21	Dr. Miller noted that it was a student who had			
22	never actually seen a patient in private practice,			
23	never practiced, never saw a patient, never took them			
24	through a care plan, and never did anything outside			

25 of a school and was now telling him as a 24-year

veteran of his field how he is supposed to be managing that patient. He explained that the student was not licensed in any of the states but was doing this as an intermediate job while he was awaiting a license. This loophole needs to be corrected.

6 Dr. Miller further explained that the person is 7 practicing medicine in Pennsylvania and telling him 8 what he can or cannot do and how to treat a patient, 9 where it is not like utilizing a code improperly or 10 doing exams too often. He commented that the number 11 one rule in medicine is do no harm, but they are 12 doing harm to patients on a daily basis because of 13 the archaic scope of practice and loopholes.

Dr. Khoury stated insurance companies are also determining what codes they will pay, where insurance companies are practicing chiropractors without a license and puts the licensee in a position of changing their standard of care based off of economic extortion by the insurance company.

20 Dr. Khoury also stated insurance companies will 21 do pre- and post-authorization for care that are 22 supposed to be peer review in Pennsylvania, noting he 23 has been reviewed by OB/GYNs for sciatic cases who 24 have never treated a sciatic case ever in their life. 25 He commented that it may not be the purview of the

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

State Board of Chiropractic until a complaint is 1 2 filed but believed that is putting the Commonwealth 3 constituents in harm's way.] * * * 4 5 Report of Board Chair [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, addressed 6 7 his attendance at the Federation of Chiropractic 8 Licensing Boards (FCLB) Meeting in Asheville, North 9 Carolina. He reported on spirited discussions and 10 going over regulations in different states. 11 Chair Aukerman noted the president of the Council 12 on Chiropractic Education president spoke, and there 13 were many different discussions on how a 14 chiropractor's social media history factors in with investigations, professional misconduct, and 15 16 prosecutions. 17 Chair Aukerman cautioned against broadcasting 18 everything they are doing in their office online, 19 because state prosecutors go on Facebook and Twitter. 20 Chair Aukerman reported on discussion on the use 21 of artificial intelligence in the chiropractic 22 profession. He stated programs are already out there 23 for medical doctors that creates a note from their 24 conversation with the patient. He mentioned the 25 importance of deciding at some point how the Board

1 would use that in their profession to protect the 2 public. 3 Chair Aukerman announced the Federation of 4 Chiropractic Licensing Boards Annual Conference is 5 April 30 through May 4, 2025, in St. Louis, MO.] * * * 6 7 Miscellaneous - Vote for Board Member Attendance at 8 the Federation of Chiropractic Licensing Boards 9 Annual Conference 10 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, requested approval to attend the Federation of Chiropractic 11 12 Licensing Boards Annual Conference, April 30 through 13 May 4, in St. Louis, MO, as a delegate for 14 Pennsylvania, along with Dr. McCullough as the 15 alternate.] CHAIR AUKERMAN: 16 17 Motion for attendance at the Annual 18 Federation of Chiropractic Licensing 19 Boards National Chiropractic Examiners 20 Annual Meeting April 30 through May 4 in St. Louis for Dr. Aukerman and Dr. 21 22 McCullough. 23 We need a voice vote to approve 24 that. 25 DR. MORELAND:

27 1 So moved. 2 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT: 3 Second. CHAIR AUKERMAN: 4 5 Roll call vote. 6 7 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Commissioner 8 Claggett, aye; Dr. McCullough, aye; 9 Elizabeth Oquendo, aye; Dr. Swank, aye; 10 Dr. Moreland, aye. 11 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 12 13 Miscellaneous - Probable Cause Screening Committee 14 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, introduced 15 Elizabeth Oquendo as the new attorney general for the 16 Board. He noted Dr. McCullough would like to serve on the Probable Cause Screening Committee also, and 17 18 Ms. Oquendo agreed.] * * * 19 20 Report of Regulatory Board Counsel - Regulations 21 Status Report October 2024 22 [Thomas M. Davis, Esquire, Board Regulatory Counsel, 23 provided a Status of Regulations Report prior to the 24 meeting for the Board's review. He noted the general 25 revisions and licensure by endorsement are on that

1 report. He mentioned several boards still have Act 2 41 regulations in the works and will be drafting 3 those as a package. He plans to work on licensure by 4 endorsement next and hopefully get that moving 5 sometime by the end of the year.

6 Dr. McCullough referred to proposed regulations 7 in 2012 regarding independent chiropractic 8 examination. He noted the Board considered those 9 reasonable regulations regarding that because their 10 act was silent as to what was and was not an 11 independent chiropractic examination.

12 Dr. McCullough stated it stopped with Governor 13 Corbett at the time of the new administration. Нe 14 explained that their primary goal is to protect the 15 public, and if a person is sent to an independent 16 doctor, there is nothing that regulates what is being 17 done to the patient because there is no doctor-18 patient relationship. He mentioned that the treating 19 chiropractor oftentimes never sees the independent 20 doctor's report and the patient never sees the 21 independent doctor's report. Dr. McCullough referred to subsection (7), noting 22

23 the Board put that in at that time because they would 24 like the independent doctor to identify any 25 potentially serious medical condition that they might

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 discover. He proffered it for the Board's review and 2 discussion about seeing whether they can get a 3 regulation regarding the practice of independent 4 medical examination. 5 Acting Commissioner Claggett stated the information would be shared with Mr. Davis.] 6 7 * * * 8 Appointment - Andrew Heck - PCA Presentation - FCLB 9 Certification Program for Chiropractic Assistants 10 [Andrew Heck, D.C., President, Pennsylvania 11 Chiropractic Association, presented to the Board to 12 discuss the delegation and role of chiropractic 13 assistants in Pennsylvania. He stated chiropractic 14 assistants help chiropractors through both 15 administrative means and providing basic clinical 16 support. 17 Dr. Heck mentioned that chiropractic assistants 18 (CAs) have taken on more responsibilities, especially 19 with adjunctive procedures being covered by insurance 20 carriers, such as therapeutic exercise and other 21 passive modalities like electric stimulation and 22 traction. 23 Dr. Heck referred to a court case in 2018, State 24 Farm v. Cavuto, which really reshaped the role of the 25 CA and how they practiced in Pennsylvania. Не

1 reported losing the ability to delegate therapeutic 2 exercise to chiropractic assistants as a result of 3 that case.

4 Dr. Heck explained that the decision was made by 5 the judge because it was deemed that therapeutic exercise in a chiropractic setting required the 6 7 education and training of a chiropractor. He stated 8 there is currently no mechanism for a chiropractic 9 assistant to be delegated to do therapeutic exercise 10 or be trained in therapeutic exercise and noted that 11 to be an issue they have been trying to solve since 12 that court case.

13 Dr. Heck stated they have been putting forth 14 legislative efforts since 2018 in order to resolve 15 this issue and also had discussions at the state Board level as well through potential regulatory 16 17 solutions. He reported engaging with a number of 18 stakeholders, the Insurance Federation of 19 Pennsylvania, the Physical Therapy Association of 20 Pennsylvania, Occupational Therapy Association, etc., 21 but continue to have opposition to their bill because 22 of the lack of national standards.

23 Dr. Heck noted the Federation Chiropractic 24 Licensing Boards announced a certified clinical 25 chiropractic assistant program, which provided

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

national CA standards and a way to educate them. He
 reported many states have adopted this program and
 hoped that Pennsylvania would get ahead of the curve.
 Dr. Heck addressed the program's educational

5 requirements, noting a minimum of 24 hours of 6 coursework. He mentioned there are different ways 7 education is approved by the FCLB, including (PACE), 8 which is probably the easiest way.

9 Dr. Heck noted there is also the ability for the 10 FCLB to approve other programs that are reviewed by 11 their committee that meet the standards required for 12 the certified clinical chiropractic assistant. He 13 mentioned CAs are also able to get approved to take 14 the test for certification if they already have 2000 15 hours of clinical experience.

Dr. Heck explained that the examination is administered by the National Board of Chiropractic Examiners, noting that entity also provides chiropractic board exams as well. He further explained that it has 100 multiple choice questions and is proctored by a chiropractor who is sitting in on the examination.

Dr. Heck noted that candidates who pass the examination receive an identification (ID), which is a way the patient could differentiate between a

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

typical chiropractic assistant versus a certified
 clinical assistant.

3 Dr. Heck addressed the renewal process, noting 4 candidates are required to complete 300 hours of 5 supervised clinical experience. He also noted they 6 would be exempt from the continuing education 7 requirements the first year but in subsequent renewals at the FCLB there is a minimum of 6 hours of 8 9 continuing education, which is something actively 10 being negotiated with interest groups.

Dr. Heck mentioned that the negotiated rate in their bill currently is 16, which is about two-thirds the requirement of a chiropractor for their continuing education. He noted continuing education is approved in a similar way to how their education is approved for chiropractors.

17 Dr. Heck referred to the initial application fees 18 of the program, noting it is cost-effective for 19 chiropractors to be able to hire people and provide 20 them with additional education that makes them more 21 valuable for their practices. He discussed the 22 importance of protecting the public, noting the 23 Certified Clinical Assistant Committee would review 24 allegations of wrongdoing by a certified clinical 25 assistant.

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

Dr. Heck mentioned there is also a board of directors that govern and administer the program, so a lot of the administrative burden that would be placed on the state board is kind of taken away because the FCLB already has established administration for the program.

7 Dr. Heck addressed other states using this mode, 8 noting there are 45 different programs across 25 9 different states, and 7 out of the 18 chiropractic 10 colleges have a program. He mentioned the American 11 Chiropractic Association also has a program.

12 Dr. Heck explained that Pennsylvania has a unique 13 need for the program because of their inability to 14 delegate therapeutic exercise, and the program 15 provides a clear path forward. He mentioned that 16 they have a national standard and could make their 17 program specific to include training and exercise 18 therapy, which would be able to differentiate their 19 current chiropractic assistance from the certified 20 chiropractic assistance.

21 Dr. Heck stated therapeutic exercise from a 22 billing perspective is a timed modality, where the 23 doctor has a requirement of the amount of time they 24 are to spend with that patient, where the more the 25 doctor or chiropractic is performing therapeutic

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

exercise, the smaller number of patients they can see
 in a certain amount of time.

3 Dr. Heck noted being hopeful that chiropractors 4 across the state will help with their legislative 5 effort in passing this bill. He requested Board 6 member feedback regarding the program as the way 7 their bill will be set up to give the Board the 8 ability to approve a national standard program to fit 9 the needs of their profession for the unique issue 10 with delegating therapeutic exercise.

Dr. Moreland thanked PCA for addressing this issue and FCLBfor creating the program. He referred to the court ruling, noting it has made it more difficult on everyone within the state to practice. He asked whether the ultimate hope is to try to pass the legislation, so they do not necessarily have to have certified chiropractic assistants.

18 Dr. Heck explained that they would need a program like this in order for the legislation to move 19 20 forward. He further explained that the order of 21 operations would be the legislation, which gives the 22 Board the authority to approve a program for 23 certified chiropractic assistance specific to the 24 delegation of therapeutic exercise, which would then 25 create the program through PCA to meet that specific

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

1 need, which could be approved by the Board. 2 Dr. Moreland requested clarification that would 3 help the PCA with the legislative to get the votes 4 needed if the state approves using the FCLB model to 5 create a certified chiropractic assistant. Dr. Heck mentioned that feedback would be 6 7 invaluable, because they are always asked by 8 legislators how something would work from a 9 regulatory standpoint and whether it would work for 10 the State Board of Chiropractic. 11 Mr. Jayman requested an update on the status of House Bill 630. 12 13 Dr. Heck noted it is currently in the House 14 Professional Licensure Committee. He reported having meetings with the chairman of that committee, but 15 16 that is as far as it has gone.] * * * 17 18 Report of Board Administrator - No Report * * * 19 20 Adjournment 21 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 22 Motion to adjourn the meeting? 23 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 24 I'd like to make a motion that we 25 adjourn the meeting.

36 DR. SWANK: 1 2 Second. 3 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 4 The meeting is adjourned. * * * 5 6 [There being no further business, the State Board of 7 Chiropractic Meeting adjourned at 11:44 a.m.] * * * 8 9 10 CERTIFICATE 11 12 I hereby certify that the foregoing summary 13 minutes of the State Board of Chiropractic meeting, 14 was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, 15 and that the minutes accurately summarize the 16 substance of the State Board of Chiropractic meeting. 17 18 19 20 Allison Walker, Minute Clerk 21 22 Sargent's Court Reporting 23 Service, Inc. 24 25 26

		37
123456789011234567890123456789012345678901234567890123456789012345678901234567890123455		STATE BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC REFERENCE INDEX
		October 17, 2024
	TIME	AGENDA
		Executive Session Return to Open Session
	10:30	Official Call to Order
	10:31	Introduction of Board Members/Attendees
	10:31	Approval of Minutes
	10:33	Report of Acting Commissioner
	10:33	Report of Board Counsel
	10:35	Appointment - Robert McGrath
	10 : 36	Report of Board Counsel (cont.)
	11:19	Report of Board Chair
	11:21	Miscellaneous
	11:24	Report of Regulatory Board Counsel
	11:28	Appointment - Andrew Heck - PCA Presentation - FCLB Certification Program for Chiropractic Assistants
	11:44	Adjournment
36 37 38		
30 39 40		
40 41 42		
42 43 44		
45		
46 47		
48 49		
50		