

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA  
DEPARTMENT OF STATE  
BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS

**F I N A L M I N U T E S**

MEETING OF:

**STATE BOARD OF CERTIFIED  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS**

TIME: 10:32 A.M.

Held at  
**PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE**  
2525 North 7th Street  
CoPA HUB, Eaton Conference Room  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110  
as well as  
**VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS**

Thursday, January 23, 2025

State Board of Certified  
Real Estate Appraisers  
January 23, 2025

BOARD MEMBERS:

Mark V. Smeltzer Sr., Chairman, Professional Member  
William T. Stoerrle Jr., Vice Chairman, Professional Member  
Michael McFarlane, Secretary, Professional Member - Absent  
John D. Ausherman, Professional Member  
Chandra Mast, Professional Member  
Jonathan B. Schuck, Professional Member  
Martha H. Brown, Esquire, Secretary of the Commonwealth Designee - Absent  
Laura Pittini, Consumer Protection Agent, Office of Attorney General Designee  
Paul H. Wentzel Jr., Senior Legislative Director, Department of Banking and Securities designee

BUREAU PERSONNEL:

Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel  
Ray J. Michalowski, Esquire, Senior Board Prosecutor and Prosecution Liaison  
Timothy A. Fritsch, Esquire, Board Prosecutor  
Kristel Hennessy Hemler, Board Administrator  
Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Deputy Policy Director, Department of State  
Jennifer Jumper, Fiscal Management Specialist 2, Bureau of Finance and Procurement, Department of State  
Amanda Richards, Fiscal Chief, Bureau of Finance and Operations, Department of State  
Taylor Koch, Fiscal Management Specialist 3, Bureau of Finance and Procurement, Department of State

ALSO PRESENT:

Emme Reiser, Political Programs Manager, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors  
Terry Cochran, Executive Director, Assessors Association of Pennsylvania  
Francesca Tracy, Compliance Analyst, The CE Shop  
Jacob Hill, Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.

1 \*\*\*

2 State Board of Certified  
3 Real Estate Appraisers  
4 January 23, 2025

5 \*\*\*

6 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act,  
7 at 9:00 a.m. the Board entered into executive session  
8 with Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, to have  
9 attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of  
10 conducting quasi-judicial deliberations. The Board  
11 returned to open session at 10:30 a.m.]

12 \*\*\*

13 [Ronald Rouse, Esquire, informed everyone that the  
14 meeting of the State Board of Certified Real Estate  
15 Appraisers was being held in a hybrid format in  
16 person and by livestreaming teleconference pursuant  
17 to Act 100 of 2021, which requires boards to use a  
18 virtual platform to conduct business when a public  
19 meeting is held.

20 Mr. Rouse noted the meeting was being recorded  
21 and voluntary participation constituted consent to be  
22 recorded.

23 Mr. Rouse also noted the Board entered into  
24 executive session with Board counsel to have  
25 attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of

1 conducting quasi-judicial deliberations.]

2 \*\*\*

3 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State  
4 Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers was held on  
5 Thursday, January 23, 2025. Mark Smeltzer, Chairman,  
6 officially called the meeting to order at 10:32 a.m.

7 \*\*\*

8 Roll Call

9 [Mark Smeltzer, Chairman, requested a roll call of  
10 Board members. A quorum of members was present.]

11 \*\*\*

12 Introduction of Attendees

13 [Kristel Hennessy Hemler, Board Administrator,  
14 provided an introduction of attendees.]

15 \*\*\*

16 Approval of minutes of the December 5, 2024 meeting

17 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

18 If we could have an approval of the  
19 minutes. Everyone has had a chance to  
20 look these over. Any questions or  
21 discussion?

22 MR. AUSERMAN:

23 I make a motion that the minutes be  
24 approved.

25 VICE CHAIRMAN STOERRLE:

1 I second it.

2 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

3 Roll call.

4

5 Mark Smeltzer, abstain; William  
6 Stoerrle, aye; John Ausherman, aye;  
7 Chandra Mast, aye; Jonathan Schuck,  
8 aye; Laura Pittini, aye; Paul Wentzel,  
9 aye.

10 [The motion carried. Mark Smeltzer abstained from  
11 voting on the motion.]

12 \*\*\*

13 Report of Prosecutorial Division

14 [Ray Michalowski, Esquire, Board Prosecutor, stated  
15 the Prosecution Division's Annual Report was not able  
16 to be scheduled for this meeting and therefore had no  
17 report to present. He further noted that there were  
18 no consent agreements to be presented. He stated any  
19 questions could be sent over to the Board.]

20 \*\*\*

21 Report of Board Counsel - Miscellaneous

22 [Ronald Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, presented on  
23 Item No. 2, a proposed rule for Appraisal  
24 Subcommittee Enforcement Authority, State Appraiser  
25 and Appraisal Management Company Regulatory Programs.]

1 Specifically, Mr. Rouse spoke about the proposed rule  
2 for Appraisal Subcommittee (ASC) enforcement  
3 authority regarding the effectiveness of the AMC and  
4 the state appraiser programs.

5 Mr. Rouse stated the purpose of the proposed rule  
6 is to further strengthen the ASC's ability to enforce  
7 action against state appraiser regulatory agencies  
8 that do not have effective appraiser and AMC  
9 programs.

10 Mr. Rouse continued with noting three specific  
11 forms of enforcement actions that the rule would  
12 allow the ASC to impose upon state regulatory  
13 agencies: Interim actions, suspensions or non-  
14 recognition of a state appraiser regulatory agency,  
15 with the non-recognition of a state appraiser  
16 regulatory agency being the most serious of the  
17 actions. He noted there could be a type of  
18 progressive enforcement as well, meaning a lesser  
19 type of penalty enforced in the form of written  
20 warnings, et cetera.

21 Mr. Rouse informed the Board that the Appraisal  
22 Subcommittee requested written comments about this  
23 proposed rule no later than February 4, 2025.

24 After asking the Board if anyone had questions  
25 about the proposed rule thus far, Chairman Smeltzer

1 commented that the ASC would be ranking the state  
2 agencies as either being effective, moderately  
3 effective, slightly effective or ineffective. The  
4 last review given them by the ASC resulted in  
5 Pennsylvania receiving a rating of "good." He  
6 reiterated, after reading many comments from  
7 individuals regarding the ASC, this was not what the  
8 current proposal was about, but instead how the ASC  
9 reviews the work done by the state agencies.

10 Chairman Smeltzer then noted he had attended a  
11 class on the ASC's requirements, and this class would  
12 be offered again on February 5, 2025. Ms. Hennessy  
13 Hemler stated Board Counsel and she had been approved  
14 by the Governor's Office to attend the virtual  
15 training on February 5, 2025 given by the ASC. Other  
16 Board members noted that they may attend as well.]

17 \*\*\*

18 Report of Board Counsel - Regulations/Statute  
19 [Ronald Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, presented on  
20 Item No. 3, Regulation 16A-7029 Distance Education  
21 and PAREA, (Practical Applications of Real Estate  
22 Appraisal).

23 Mr. Rouse began by stating that the Board had a  
24 copy of the final annex and final preamble for the  
25 rulemaking regarding distance education and PAREA.

1 He suggested the Board could discuss and potentially  
2 vote that day on whether or not to adopt the final  
3 rulemaking.

4 He noted that one of the changes between the  
5 proposed regulation and the final regulation was the  
6 AQB's (Appraisal Qualifications Board) having  
7 determined that the accepted definition of a Mentor  
8 was "any individual that was either a state certified  
9 residential appraiser or a general real estate  
10 appraiser that was certified within any jurisdiction  
11 that met the AQB for teaching PAREA program  
12 participants," (Annex, pg. 3, Sec.36.1). Mr. Rouse  
13 stated that clarification of the definition of PAREA  
14 was also amended to state "any approved AQB simulated  
15 experience training program that was offered as an  
16 alternate path for licensed appraiser trainees to  
17 obtain appraiser certification," (Sec. 36.11-E).  
18 Additional requested changes to the Annex of the  
19 regulation were amended as well.

20 Mr. Rouse suggested, if a motion by the Board and  
21 a vote to approve the final regulation were to occur,  
22 regulatory counsel and he would prepare the package  
23 for the legislature and the IRRC (Independent  
24 Regulatory Review Commission).

25 Chairman Smeltzer then suggested that the Board



1 first open the issue up to the public for comments or  
2 questions about this regulation before the Board  
3 voted on it. The question was asked of the public,  
4 but there were no forthcoming comments or questions  
5 from same.]

6 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

7 The Chair would entertain a motion to  
8 accept the final regulation proposal.

9 VICE CHAIRMAN STOERRLE:

10 Make that motion.

11 MR. AUSERMAN:

12 I second.

13 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

14 Roll call.

15  
16 Mark Smeltzer, aye; William Stoerrle,  
17 aye; John Auserman, aye; Chandra Mast,  
18 aye; Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura  
19 Pittini, aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

20 [The motion passed unanimously.]

21 \*\*\*

22 Appointment - Bureau of Finance and Operations  
23 [Jennifer Jumper, Fiscal Management Specialist 2,  
24 Bureau of Finance and Procurement, Department of  
25 State presented the Annual Budget Report.

1 Ms. Jumper began by showing the Board their  
2 seven-year history of renewable license counts,  
3 (licenses that need to be renewed soon), which had  
4 decreased by 0.2%. Ms. Jumper explained that  
5 licensure renewal fees for this Board renew in June  
6 of odd years and contain the fees for the following  
7 licensed classes: Certified Residential Appraiser,  
8 Certified General Appraiser, Certified Pennsylvania  
9 Evaluator and the Certified Broker/Appraiser, all  
10 being at a current renewal rate of \$225. Appraisal  
11 Management Companies (AMC) are paying \$1000, and  
12 licensed appraiser trainees are paying \$150 to renew.

13 She further noted that renewal fees will go up 23%  
14 in June of 2027, 8% in June of 2029, and 10% in June,  
15 2031.

16 Ms. Jumper also stated the total biennial revenue  
17 for the Board was 1.23 million with 92.2% of that  
18 revenue coming from renewal and application fees.

19 Moving on to expenses, Ms. Jumper then defined  
20 the different cost categories as follows: Timesheet  
21 based expenses, direct charge expenses and licensee  
22 population expenses, which are different for every  
23 state Board. Budgeted expenses were expected to  
24 increase from 1.63 million to 1.81 million. The  
25 major item causing the increase in expenses is the

1 updating of the PALS (Pennsylvania Licensing System).  
2 It was additionally noted that the Board has an  
3 upcoming state inspection this year.

4 Ms. Jumper presented an overview of the Board's  
5 revenues and expenses to reflect the overall  
6 financial standing of same. She noted their current  
7 monetary balance, with expenses already exceeding  
8 revenues, and projected to continue onward.

9 It was further clarified by Amanda Richards,  
10 Fiscal Chief, Bureau of Finance and Operations,  
11 Department of State, that the PALS modernization  
12 numbers were not included in the current/prior fee  
13 package that was approved because there was  
14 uncertainty as to what those numbers would be.  
15 However, she stated, there was now a better idea of  
16 the numbers, and they would be included in the next  
17 fee review.

18 Ms. Jumper recommended that the Board do another  
19 fee increase and advised that they would return in  
20 the Spring with a new fee package for the Board to  
21 review.

22 Mr. Stoerrle suggested that the Office of  
23 Procurement should consider the fact that the  
24 percentage of residential appraisers was predicted to  
25 go down by 20-25% and should therefore be considered

1 when formulating a new fee package. It was noted  
2 that AMC's, their largest source of revenue from  
3 renewals, were projected to be down 10%. A graduated  
4 fee increase cost of 5% over each of the next three  
5 biennial periods would be in addition to the 23%, 8%  
6 and 10% increase for same in 2027, 2029, 2031.  
7 Discussion continued between Board members regarding  
8 the following: Investigative hourly costs, consumer  
9 complaints on appraisals, miswording in  
10 certifications and attestation. The ASC's  
11 enforcement requirements, DEI, (Diversity, Equity and  
12 Inclusion), and investigations were noted.]

13 \*\*\*

14 Report of Board Counsel - Regulations/Statute (Cont.)  
15 [Ronald Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, advised the  
16 Board, since the budget presentation would determine  
17 the new fee regulation costs, Regulation 16A-7025  
18 (Fees) would be on hold until the Bureau of Finance  
19 and Procurement (BFP) returned in the Spring with an  
20 updated proposed fee package.]

21 \*\*\*

22 Report of Board Chairman  
23 [Mark V. Smeltzer Sr., Chairman, Professional Member,  
24 stated that the Association of Appraiser Regulatory  
25 Officials (AARO) meetings would be held twice a year

1 with one virtual meeting and one in person meeting.  
2 The next meeting in April or May would be a virtual  
3 meeting and therefore less expensive for those who  
4 wanted to attend. He questioned the Board on the  
5 possibility of sending more than three members to the  
6 upcoming virtual meeting.

7 Mr. Rouse suggested that a vote would have to be  
8 taken on this question once the cost of attendance  
9 and dates of the meeting were known. He reiterated  
10 that documentation was needed first.

11 Details of the upcoming AARO meeting and other  
12 AARO meeting dates were discussed.

13 It was decided by the Board that a motion and  
14 vote on same could be put on the March meeting agenda  
15 provided the documentation for cost and dates had  
16 been received by the Board.]

17 \*\*\*  
18 Report of Board Administrator - No Report

19 \*\*\*  
20 Conference Reports - No Report

21 \*\*\*  
22 Report of Committees  
23 Revisions to Experience Logs, Supervisor Application  
24 and Trainee Checklist

25 [Mr. Rouse stated, for the benefit of Chairman  
26 Smeltzer, that the last meeting consisted of

1 discussion on revisions and amendments to certain  
2 licensee forms, "Resources and Documents from the  
3 State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers",  
4 specifically, the experience logs, supervisor  
5 application and trainee checklist. He also noted  
6 that the Board was reviewing the changes to these  
7 forms from the last meeting and, on that day, could  
8 decide whether to adopt the updated forms.

9 Chairman Smeltzer then asked for the forms to be  
10 put up of the screen again and shown, in case there  
11 were any additional comments. Sections E and F were  
12 where the revisions were made. Mr. Rouse proceeded  
13 to read the revisions from these sections.

14 Ms. Hennessy-Hemler noted that there were also  
15 changes to section I, subsections P, C and R as well.

16 Mr. Rouse proceeded to read aloud the definitions  
17 given for these form subsections. There was  
18 additional review of other changes made to certain  
19 form documents, including, experience logs, registry  
20 for supervisor, and trainee checklist.

21 It was decided that a motion to approve the  
22 changes be taken.]

23 MR. ROUSE:

24 Would the Chair entertain a motion to  
25 adopt the experience logs, supervisor

1 application and trainee checklist as  
2 the approved documents of the Board?

3 VICE CHAIRMAN STOERRLE:

4 Bill Stoerrle, make that motion.

5 MR. AUSHERMAN:

6 Second.

7 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

8 Roll Call.

9  
10 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;  
11 John Ausherman, aye; Chandra Mast, aye;  
12 Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura Pittini,  
13 aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

14 [The motion carried unanimously.]

15 \*\*\*

16 Applications for Review

17 MR. ROUSE:

18 Item No. 6 on the agenda is Laurence  
19 Gluckman, Reactivation Application No.  
20 AA0005905673. After discussion in  
21 Executive Session, I believe the Chair  
22 would entertain a motion to  
23 provisionally deny the reactivation  
24 application of Laurence Gluckman.

25 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

1                   The Chair would entertain that motion.

2 MR. AUSHERMAN:

3                   I so move.

4 MS. MAST:

5                   I second.

6 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

7                   Roll call.

8

9                   Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;

10                  John Ausherman, aye; Chandra Mast, aye;

11                  Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura Pittini,

12                  aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

13 [The motion carried unanimously.]

14   \*\*\*

15 Review of Requests

16 MR. ROUSE:

17                   I believe the Chair would entertain a

18                   motion to grant the licensed appraiser

19                   trainee renewal extension of Toni

20                   Pagano Snively, LAT000711 at Item No. 7

21                   on the agenda.

22 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

23                   The Chair would entertain that motion.

24 MR. AUSHERMAN:

25                   I so move.



1 MS. MAST:

2 I second.

3 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

4 Roll call.

5

6 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;

7 John Ausherman, aye; Chandra Mast, aye;

8 Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura Pittini,

9 aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

10 [The motion carried unanimously.]

11 \*\*\*

12 MR. ROUSE:

13 Item No. 8 on the agenda. I believe the  
14 Chair would entertain a motion to grant  
15 the licensed appraiser trainee renewal  
16 extension request of Carrie Gallo,  
17 LAT000787.

18 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

19 I would entertain such a motion.

20 MR. STOERRLE:

21 I'd make that motion.

22 MS. MAST:

23 I second.

24 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

25 Roll call.

1

2

Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;

3

John Ausherman, aye; Chandra Mast, aye;

4

Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura Pittini,

5

aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

6

[The motion carried unanimously.]

7

\*\*\*

8

Miscellaneous - The Appraisal Foundation and Farm

9

Credit System

10

[Chairman Smeltzer notified the Board that on January

11

6, 2025 the Appraisal Foundation released a press

12

statement acknowledging their collaboration with the

13

Farm Credit System to build a rural appraisal

14

practicum model. He also stated that this project

15

will create a structured, hands-on model tailored for

16

rural and agricultural property appraisers.

17

Chairman Smeltzer then asked if there was any

18

discussion from the Board needed on this issue,

19

specifically, if the Board could accept practicums.

20

Mr. Rouse advised that the Board's regulations

21

allow them to accept practicums.]

22

\*\*\*

23

Public Comments/Discussion - None

24

\*\*\*

25

Matters for Discussion - Election of Officers

1 MR. ROUSE:

2 Item No. 10 on the agenda. Is there a  
3 nomination for Chair of the State Board  
4 of Certified Real Estate Appraisers?

5 MR. STOERRLE:

6 I'd like to nominate Mark Smeltzer.

7 MR. AUSERMAN:

8 Second.

9 MR. ROUSE:

10 Are there any other nominations for the  
11 Chair of the State Board of Certified  
12 Real Estate Appraisers?

13 Then is there a motion to elect Mark  
14 Smeltzer as the Chair of the State  
15 Board of Certified Real Estate  
16 Appraisers?

17 MS. MAST:

18 I make a motion.

19 MR. AUSERMAN:

20 Second.

21 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

22 Roll call.

23

24 Mark Smeltzer, abstain; Bill Stoerrle,  
25 aye; John Auserman, aye; Chandra Mast,

1                   aye; Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura  
2                   Pittini, aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

3 [The motion carried unanimously.]

4                                   \*\*\*

5 MR. ROUSE:

6                   Is there a motion for Vice Chair for the  
7                   State Board of Certified Real Estate  
8                   Appraisers?

9 MR. AUSERMAN:

10                   I nominate William Stoerrle.

11 MS. MAST:

12                   I second.

13 MR. ROUSE:

14                   Are there any other nominations for  
15                   Vice Chair of the State Board of  
16                   Certified Real Estate Appraisers?

17                   Then is there a motion to elect Bill  
18                   Stoerrle as the Vice Chair of the State  
19                   Board of Certified Real Estate  
20                   Appraisers?

21 MR. AUSERMAN:

22                   I so move.

23 MS. MAST:

24                   I second.

25 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

1 Roll call.

2

3 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle,  
4 abstain; John Ausherman, aye; Chandra  
5 Mast, aye; Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura  
6 Pittini, aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

7 [The motion carried unanimously.]

8

\*\*\*

9 MR. ROUSE:

10 Is there a nomination for Secretary for  
11 the State Board of Certified Real  
12 Estate Appraisers?

13 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

14 This is Mark Smeltzer. I'm going to  
15 nominate Chandra Mast.

16 MS. PITTINI:

17 I second.

18 MR. ROUSE:

19 Are there any other nominations for  
20 Secretary of the State Board of  
21 Certified Real Estate Appraisers?

22 Hearing none, then is there a motion  
23 to elect Chandra Mast as the Secretary  
24 of the State Board of Certified Real  
25 Estate Appraisers?

1 MR. STOERRLE:

2 I'd like to make that motion.

3 MR. AUSERMAN:

4 I second.

5 MR. ROUSE:

6 Any discussion? Roll call please.

7

8 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;

9 John Auserman, aye; Chandra Mast,

10 abstain; Jonathan Schuck, aye; Laura

11 Pittini, aye; Paul Wentzel, aye.

12 [The motion carried unanimously.]

13 \*\*\*

14 Hearings - No report

15 \*\*\*

16 Adjournment

17 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

18 Is there any other discussion or

19 anything anyone needed to talk about

20 anything else?

21 Then the Chair would entertain a

22 motion to adjourn.

23 MR. WENTZEL:

24 So moved.

25 MR AUSERMAN:

1 Second.

2 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

3 We are adjourned.

4 \*\*\*

5 [It was noted the next Board meeting will be held  
6 virtually and in person on March 13th, 2025.]

7 \*\*\*

8 [There being no further business, the State Board of  
9 Certified Real Estate Appraisers Meeting adjourned at  
10 11:52 a.m.]

11 \*\*\*

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

## CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers meeting.



Jacob Hill,

Minute Clerk

Sargent's Court Reporting  
Service, Inc.



STATE BOARD OF CERTIFIED  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS  
REFERENCE INDEX  
January 23, 2025

TIME	AGENDA
9:00	Executive Session
10:30	Return to Open Session
10:32	Official Call to Order
10:32	Roll Call
10:32	Introduction of Attendees
10:34	Approval of Minutes
10:36	Report of Prosecutorial Division
10:36	Report of Board Counsel
10:38	Regulations/Statute
10:30	Report of Board Administrator
11:00	Appointment
11:31	Report of Committees
11:46	Miscellaneous
11:48	Public Comments/Discussion
11:52	Adjournment